Understanding EU environmental law in the age of the Green Deal

Prof Dr Marjan Peeters
Maastricht Centre of European Law
Law Faculty / Maastricht University

Friday 30 October 2020
Purpose of this talk

- Complexity of EU environmental law
- The green deal: a ‘green dream’
- Aiming at zero pollution and climate neutrality
- The challenge of implementation and enforcement
- The role of procedural rights used by civil society
- Understanding EU Environmental Law
### (Unavoidable) Complexity: reasons

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>It is not easy to regulate the environmental domain given its width</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Ecosystems contain many different (inter-linked) elements;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Developing a truly integrated (or circular) regulatory approach is complicated and has its limits</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Choice for (very) different regulatory instruments</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Command and control, market-based, information-based, liability provisions;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- But also a mix of hard and soft law approaches towards Member States</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Technical law, and (in some area’s) many amendments</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Example: many amendments of the EU emissions trading system</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Compromises at EU level plus need for subsidiarity</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Trilogue (negotiations by EU legislative institutions);</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Implementation discretion for Member States</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Tension of environmental protection with other interests</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Balancing interests – role of the courts v discretion of the legislator</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Ambitious policy plan of the European Commission: a dream!

- **Ambition of zero pollution**
- **Climate neutrality**
- **Rigorous enforcement (energy and climate)**
Climate neutrality (as proposed)

“Union-wide emissions and removals of greenhouse gases regulated in Union law shall be balanced at the latest by 2050, thus reducing emissions to net zero by that date.”

“The relevant Union institutions and the Member States shall take the necessary measures at Union and national level respectively, to enable the collective achievement of the climate-neutrality objective set out in paragraph 1, taking into account the importance of promoting fairness and solidarity among Member States.”

(emphasis by author) Quotes from COM(2020)80

The European Council, in its conclusions of 12 December 2019, agreed on the objective of achieving a climate-neutral EU by 2050 (with one MS making a reservation for implementation)

No requirement for national climate neutrality in all Member States
On-going:

Proposals and policy plans to set more ambitious emission reduction targets for 2030 and 2050

Announced, for June 2021:

Legislative proposals to implement the more ambitious target for 2030
Main legislation for achieving emission reductions in the EU that NEEDS compliance and amendment

**Effort sharing:**
Binding emission reduction targets for member states

**Emissions trading:**
Gradual emission reduction (by means of a declining cap) obligatory for major industries and aviation (in Europe)

Land Use, Land Use Change and Forestry

Other measures

Funding

Roadmap
Feedback period
29 October 2020 - 26 November 2020

FEEDBACK: OPEN
Challenge: implementation and enforcement

The hard choices when implementing the law, plus need for capacity

Inspection and enforcement – at Member State level

Limited competences at EU level - Soft law (guidances) at EU level

Wake up call: car emissions scandal

See also for example T-751/18 - Daimler v Commission
Strong rights for ENGO’s to protect the voiceless environment

• Access to information and public participation including access to justice to enforce these rights – -> a tool for civil society to promote and check implementation and compliance

• Access to justice (9(3) Aarhus Convention)
  – “members of the public have access to administrative or judicial procedures to challenge acts and omissions by private persons and public authorities which contravene provisions of its national law relating to the environment” compliance by the EU ? / next slide
Recent developments article 9(3) Aarhus Convention


The Aarhus Convention

The EU & the Aarhus Convention: in the EU Member States, in the Community Institutions and Bodies

Legislative proposal to amend Aarhus legislation

On 14 October 2020, the European Commission adopted a legislative proposal amending the Aarhus Regulation No. 1367/2006 to allow for better public scrutiny of EU acts affecting the environment. The proposed amendments improve the possibilities to request that the EU institutions review such acts to better ensure environmental protection.

- Proposal for a regulation on amending Aarhus regulation
- Communication: improving access to justice in environmental matters in the EU and its Member States

The legislative proposal is now with the European Parliament and with the Council.
Meanwhile

Litigation against the EU and EU member states with regard to climate policies (selection)

At EU level:
- Carvalho and others (appeal)
- Forest / Biomass case (appeal)

At Member State level:
- The Netherlands: Urgenda
- Ireland: Friends of the Irish Environment case
- Germany: Farmers and Greenpeace v Germany
- France: The case of the century
- Other....

European Convention of Human Rights – so other than EU law - but against EU Member States:

Claim of four Portuguese children / young adults against 27 Member States and 6 other European States
Next to hard climate law: the (new) governance approach to achieve climate neutrality -> Regulation 2018/1999 of 11 December 2018

Governance by means of **obligatory national integrated climate and energy plans** (for 2021 to 2030), and national long term strategies

in order to ensure an `ongoing dialogue between the Commission and the Member States and, where appropriate, between the Member States’ (para 54)
The European Energy Union and Climate Action Governance Dialogue

• Member states are obliged to develop plans – explaining their national policies- and long term strategies
• Obligatory content of the plans
• Consultation of the public has to take place

• The European Commission assesses the national plans and has the power to provide recommendations, which have to be taken in due account by Member States

Transparency Required
Enforceability of this soft approach?

The governance approach is a truly complex framework (see annex I and II to this presentation).

The way how it will operate has yet to be proven, but some elements (such as the obligation to submit a plan, and the content it needs to discuss) seem legally enforceable.

Importantly, the Commission gets the power, even the obligation in case the EU falls short of its aim, to provide recommendations to Member States, and Member states have to take due account (see annex II).

The Commission shall assess whether Member States have taken due account of certain recommendations.
Future litigation in order to reach compliance and ‘better’ climate policies by Member States: any role for the (non-binding) recommendations?

Will the recommendations of the Commission provide some arguments for national litigation procedures trying to enforce better (including more ambitious) national policies?

- At least the judicial systems of The Netherlands and in Ireland seem to provide some opportunities given their national climate case law

This possible role of Commission Recommendations will *inter alia* depend on the level of detail with regard to how member states have to improve their policies

- But if this (very uncertain) legal effect will take place: then we see an increase of power of the European Commission, which needs to be further discussed in view of the rule of law and democracy, and its wider effect on the stability of the European Union itself – even while it is prosperous for the protection of the climate
The truth regarding understanding EU environmental law

It is impossible for one single person to master the whole field of EU climate and energy law, let alone environmental law

- including its `external integration dimension’ – so the presence of environmental provisions in other domains of EU law

- and including its external dimension with third countries, and its extraterritorial reach
Understanding and teaching EU environmental law

Understanding:
Specialisation is needed
Networking, cooperation is essential, also through conferences and books, together with regular studying / training / updating

Teaching:
1) Acquiring good knowledge of core issues, such as:
   - EU Competences (including more stringent national action),
   - Environmental procedural rights, including access to justice,
   - Core Regulatory Instruments and related case law,
   - Inspection and enforcement,
   embedded into a good understanding of what the EU actually is

2) Skill development, including critical thinking, is essential!

Webinars
Online lectures
Thank you and stay safe!
The Commission may issue recommendations on the level of ambition of the draft integrated national energy and climate plans, on the subsequent implementation of policies and measures of the notified integrated national energy and climate plans, and on other national policies and measures of relevance for the implementation of the Energy Union.

*Whereas recommendations have no binding force, Member States should nevertheless take due account of such recommendations and explain in subsequent progress reports how they have done so.*

If the Member State concerned does not address a recommendation or a substantial part thereof, that Member State shall provide and make public its reasons.

In addition, the Commission shall as appropriate issue recommendations to Member States to ensure the achievement of the objectives of the Energy Union. The Commission shall make such recommendations publicly available (art. 34).

The Commission shall assess whether Member States have taken due account of these Commission recommendations (art. 13).
Annex II: some selected articles of the Governance of the Energy Union and Climate Action Regulation

**Article 30**

Inconsistencies with overarching Energy Union objectives and targets under Regulation (EU) 2018/842

1. Based on the assessment pursuant to Article 29, the Commission shall issue recommendations to a Member State pursuant to Article 34 if policy developments in that Member State show inconsistencies with the overarching objectives of the Energy Union.

**Article 34**

Commission recommendations to Member States

1. The Commission shall as appropriate issue recommendations to Member States to ensure the achievement of the objectives of the Energy Union. The Commission shall make such recommendations publicly available forthwith.

**Article 13:**

The Commission shall assess whether Member States have taken due account of the Commission recommendations issued pursuant to Article 34.
Annex III:
some examples of current consultations (Have you say) to sharpen existing climate legislation

(printscreen from announcement of 30 October 2020)